

VISUAL ARTS

High-Quality Instructional Materials Review Rubric

Grade Range: K-12

Evaluator		Rating Committee	
Publisher			
Title of Textbook Series/Instructional Program			
Grade Range of Textbook Series/Instructional Program		Specific Grade Evaluated	

Publisher indicated curriculum type: Comprehensive Curriculum Complementary Curriculum

This evaluation rubric is designed to offer an evaluation to determine how well instructional materials align to the [Mississippi College- and Career- Readiness Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts](#) other criteria for high-quality instructional materials for K-12 Visual Arts courses. The evaluation rubric includes key considerations for high-quality instructional materials and outlines three **Gateways** for consideration when evaluating materials. Within each **Gateway**, **Criterion** and related **Indicators** are provided along with **Guiding/Key Questions**.



The evaluation rubric is designed to allow reviewers to determine a threshold for quality for each gateway. Remember to focus on what is present in the instructional materials and any ancillary or complementary resources rather than what might be inferred. All scores should be based on evidence observed from the instructional materials themselves.

Scoring Protocol and Criteria:

- **No evidence (0):** No correlation between the standards and lessons, a logical sequence of content cannot be identified, and/or there appear to be significant content inaccuracies, essential understandings, knowledge, or skills are not addressed, and opportunities to practice essential skills are not included.
- **Limited (1 or 2):** Limited connections between the standards and the lessons are noted, content appears to contain some inaccuracies or is not always clear, essential understandings, knowledge, or skills are not sufficiently addressed, and there is limited opportunity for students to practice essential skills.
- **Adequate (2 or 4):** Lessons are aligned with the standards, content appears accurate clear, and in sequential order, most of the essential understandings, knowledge, and skills are supported, and many opportunities are provided for students to practice essential skills.

The High-Quality Instructional Materials Review Rubric is comprised of three sections:

Gateway 1: Alignment to Standards - **This is a requirement for submission.**

→ Advance to Gateway 2 only if Gateway 1 has a score of at least **11 points**.

Gateway 2: Rigor and Instructional Practices - **This is a requirement for submission.**

→ Advance to Gateway 3 only if Gateway 2 has a score of at least **12 points**.

Gateway 3: Usability

GATEWAY 1

Alignment to Standards - This is a requirement for submission.

High-quality Theatre course materials are coherent and aligned with *Mississippi College- and Career-Readiness (MCCR) Arts Learning Standards*. Promote visual arts literacy, guiding how to apply artistic processes, identifying creative practices, enduring understandings, and essential questions to articulate value, and meaning within and across the arts discipline. The four artistic processes are **Creating**, **Performing/Presenting/Producing**, **Responding**, and **Connecting**. Performance standards measure proficiency levels across grades from kindergarten to high school. These standards impart the breadth and depth of the visual arts experience through the art-making processes. To determine the Gateway rating, educators use evidence gathered from the instructional materials to score indicators related to each criterion.

- Criterion 1.1 (1a – 1d): Alignment and Accuracy**
 Materials adequately address the *MCCR Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts*.
- Criterion 1.2 (1e – 1h): Learning Progressions and Coherence Artistic Processes**
 Materials attend to the learning progressions emphasized in the standards so that the curriculum is coherent both within grades and across grade bands and are coherent and consistent with the progressions in the *MCCR Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts*. Materials should support the artistic processes of creating, performing/producing, connecting/cultural and historical perspectives, and responding/aesthetic response and critique methodologies to cultivate authentic student engagement.

Criterion 1.1: ALIGNMENT AND ACCURACY			
CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	GUIDING/KEY QUESTIONS	SCORE
Materials adequately address the MS CCR Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts 12 possible points	COMPREHENSIVE CURRICULUM ONLY: 1a. Materials support instruction of the <i>Mississippi CCR Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts</i> . (2 points)	Do the materials present a level of sophistication appropriate to meet the full intent of the <i>Mississippi CCR Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts</i> ? Are the materials coherent regarding both artistic domain and genre?	0 1 2
	COMPLEMENTARY CURRICULUM ONLY: 1a. Instructional materials align with at least 50 percent of the <i>Mississippi CCR Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts</i> . (2 points)	Does the curriculum support students in achieving proficiency at least 50 percent of the standards?	0 1 2

	1b. Materials support student creative and artistic expression as outlined by the <i>Mississippi CCR Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts</i> . (2 points)	How do materials encourage student creative and artistic expression and problem-solving? How do materials support students in cultivating skills of analysis, interpretation, or evaluation of artistic works?	0 1 2
	1c. Materials develop student artistic skills and fluencies appropriate to the grade level, as outlined by the <i>Mississippi CCR Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts</i> . (4 points)	How do materials provide support for students to engage in and develop a variety of artistic skills or techniques? How do the materials make meaningful connections to prior student learning or experiences?	0 2 4
	1d. Materials engage students in the content and skills outlined in the CCR Arts Learning Standards for Visual Arts. (4 points)	How are students engaged with learning? How do the materials make intentional inclusion of student voice and choice?	0 2 4
TOTAL SCORE CRITERION 1.1			
Meets: 10-12 points Partially Meets: 7-9 points Does Not Meet: 0-6 points			
Criterion 1.2: LEARNING PROGRESSIONS and COHERENCE			
CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	GUIDING/KEY QUESTIONS	SCORE
Each grade’s instructional materials are coherent and consistent with the progressions in the Standards. 8 possible points	1e. CREATING Materials support students to create new artistic ideas and work. (2 points)	How do the materials support students to generate, organize, develop, and refine their personal artistic ideas? How do the materials support students in understanding the language of their art form (e.g., notation, vocabulary, techniques, or certain artistic practices)?	0 1 2
	1f. PERFORMING/PRODUCING Materials support the realization of artistic ideas through student performance or production. (2 points)	How do the materials support students' development and refinement of artistic techniques through presentation, analysis, and feedback?	0 1 2

		How do the materials encourage opportunities for students to convey meaning through performance and production?	
	1g. RESPONDING/ AESTHETIC RESPONSE AND CRITIQUE METHODOLOGIES Materials provide opportunities for students to respond to artistic work through perception, analysis, interpretation, and evaluation. (2 points)	How do the materials allow students to perceive and analyze/critique artistic work of their own, their peers, and other artists? Do materials provide scaffolds and support for students to interpret intent and meaning in artistic work?	0 1 2
	1h. CONNECTING/ CULTURAL AND HISTORICAL PERSPECTIVES Materials provide opportunities for students to connect artistic ideas and work with personal meaning and external context. (2 points)	How do materials encourage students to synthesize and relate knowledge or personal experiences to artmaking? Do materials include societal, cultural, or historical context to deepen artistic literacy and understanding?	0 1 2
TOTAL SCORE CRITERION 1.2			
Meets: 7-8 points Partially Meets: 5-6 points Does Not Meet: 0-4 points			

Gateway 1 Points AVAILABLE	Gateway 1 Points ACHIEVED	GATEWAY 1 RATING
20	Sum of points from Criterion 1.1 and 1.2	<input type="checkbox"/> Meets (score of 16-20 points) PROCEED TO GATEWAY 2 <input type="checkbox"/> Partially Meets (score of 11-15 points) PROCEED TO GATEWAY 2 <input type="checkbox"/> Does Not Meet (score of 0-10 points) STOP REVIEW

GATEWAY 2

Rigor and Instructional Practices - This is a requirement for submission.

Gateway 2 examines the way materials support students to meet the standard's rigorous expectations by giving appropriate attention to: The arts experience through the art-making processes and the four artistic processes: Creating, Performing/Presenting/Producing, Responding, and Connecting.

Criterion 2.1 (2a – 2c): Student Learning

Materials identify ways in which materials are designed for each student’s regular and active participation in grade-level/grade band/series content.

Criterion 2.2 (2d – 2g): Instructional Design

Materials align with student-centered practices and allow opportunities for students to explore content.

Criterion 2.1: STUDENT LEARNING			
CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	GUIDING/KEY QUESTIONS	SCORE
Materials identify ways in which materials are designed for each student’s regular and active participation in grade-level/grade band/series content. 8 possible points	2a. Materials provide student guidance with useful annotations and suggestions for how to use the materials and ancillary materials to support their learning and development. (4 points)	Do the materials engage students to guide their artistic, creative, and technical development?	0 2 4
	2b. Materials provide strategies and supports for students in special populations to work with grade-level/course-level content and to meet grade- or skill-level standards that will support their regular and active participation. (2 points)	Do materials provide differentiation support to engage all students in the arts disciplines' content? Do the materials include overarching guidance on strategies and accommodations for special populations?	0 1 2
	2c. Materials regularly provide extensions to engage with concepts or skills at greater depth for students who read, write, speak, listen, or perform artistic skills above grade- or skill level. (2 points)	Do materials suggest strategies and support for student's exploration of grade- or skill-level content at a higher level of complexity, not students completing additional tasks, but as an extension of their learning?	0 1 2

TOTAL SCORE CRITERION 2.1			
Meets: 7-8 points Partially Meets: 5-6 points Does Not Meet: 0-4 points			
Criterion 2.2 INSTRUCTIONAL DESIGN			
CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	GUIDING/KEY QUESTIONS	SCORE
Materials align with student-centered practices and allow opportunities for students to explore content. 14 possible points	2d. Materials integrate technology such as assistive technology (text to speech, audio), interactive tools, and/or virtual manipulatives/objects in ways that engage students in the art discipline subject areas. (4 points)	Do the materials integrate digital technology and interactive tools in ways that support student engagement in the arts subject?	0 2 4
	2e. Materials include or reference digital technology that provides opportunities for students to collaborate. (2 points)	Do digital materials provide opportunities for students to collaborate?	0 1 2
	2f. The visual design (whether in print or digital) supports students in engaging thoughtfully with the art discipline subject areas. (4 points)	Does visual design support student learning and engagement?	0 2 4
	2g. Materials provide teacher guidance for the use of embedded technology to support and enhance student learning. (4 points)	Do the materials provide teacher guidance for the use of embedded technology to support and enhance student learning?	0 2 4
TOTAL SCORE CRITERION 2.2			
Meets: 11-14 points Partially Meets: 8-10 points Does Not Meet: 0-7 points			

Gateway 2 Points AVAILABLE	Gateway 2 Points ACHIEVED	GATEWAY 2 RATING
22	Sum of points from Criterion 2.1 and 2.2	<input type="checkbox"/> Meets (score of 17-22 points) PROCEED TO GATEWAY 3 <input type="checkbox"/> Partially Meets (score of 12-16 points) PROCEED TO GATEWAY 3 <input type="checkbox"/> Does Not Meet (score of 0-11 points) STOP REVIEW

GATEWAY 3

Usability

Materials support teachers to fully utilize the curriculum understand the skills and learning of their students and support a range of learners. To determine the Gateway rating, educators use evidence gathered from the instructional materials to score indicators related to each criterion.

- Criterion 3.1 (3a – 3d): Teacher Supports**
 Materials include resources for teachers to effectively plan and implement materials with integrity and to further develop their professional learning.
- Criterion 3.2 (3e – 3h): Assessment**
 Materials offer assessment opportunities that genuinely measure progress and elicit direct, observable evidence of the degree to which students can independently demonstrate the assessed standards.
- Criterion 3.3 (3i – 3o): Student Supports**
 Materials designed for each student’s regular and active participation in grade-level/grade-band/series content.
- Criterion 3.4 (3p – 3s): Intentional Design**
 Materials support students and teachers with a visual design that is engaging and references or integrates digital technology with guidance for teachers.

Criterion 3.1: TEACHER SUPPORTS			
CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	GUIDING/KEY QUESTIONS	SCORE
Materials include resources for teachers to effectively plan and implement materials with integrity and to further develop their professional learning. 8 possible points	3a. Materials provide teacher guidance with useful annotations and suggestions for how to enact the student materials and ancillary materials, with specific attention to engaging students to guide their artistic, creative, and technical development. (2 points)	Do the materials provide teacher guidance with useful annotations and suggestions for how to use the student materials and ancillary materials?	0 1 2
	3b. Materials include standards correlation information that explains the role of the standards in the context of the overall series. (2 points)	Do the materials include examples of more complex concepts or skills so teachers can improve their knowledge of the arts discipline’s subject areas?	0 1 2

	3c. Materials provide strategies for informing all stakeholders, including students, parents, or caregivers about the program and suggestions for how they can help support student progress and achievement. (2 points)	Do materials provide explanations of the instructional approaches appropriate to the arts discipline's subject areas?	0 1 2
	3d. Materials provide a comprehensive list of supplies needed to support instructional activities. (2 points)	Do the materials identify research-based instructional activities?	0 1 2
TOTAL SCORE CRITERION 3.1			
Meets: 7-8 points Partially Meets: 5-6 points Does Not Meet: 0-4 points			
Criterion 3.2: ASSESSMENTS			
CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	GUIDING/KEY QUESTIONS	SCORE
Materials includes a system of assessments identifying how materials provide tools, guidance, and support for teachers to collect, interpret, and act on data about student progress towards the standards. 12 possible points	3e. Assessment information is included in the materials to indicate which standards are assessed. (2 points)	Are assessments aligned with the standards?	0 1 2
	3f. Assessment system provides multiple opportunities throughout the grade, course, and/or series to determine students' learning and sufficient guidance to teachers for interpreting student performance and suggestions for follow-up. (4 points)	Do materials include various methods of assessment specific to the art form? Are multiple types of assessments provided?	0 2 4
	3g. Assessments include opportunities for students to demonstrate the full intent of grade-level/course-level standards and practices across the series. (4 points)	Do materials support the usage of a variety of accommodations (alterations of timing, setting, presentation, and response,) that allow the student to demonstrate their knowledge, skills, and abilities?	0 2 4

	3h. Assessments offer accommodations that allow students to demonstrate their knowledge and skills without changing the content of the assessment. (2 points)	Do materials include scoring guidance (e.g., rubrics, anchors) and best practices for the art form? Does guidance include support for teachers to adjust instruction and suggestions for follow-up?	0 1 2
--	--	--	-------

TOTAL SCORE CRITERION 3.2
Meets: 10-12 points | **Partially Meets:** 7-9 points | **Does Not Meet:** 0-6 points

Criterion 3.3: STUDENT SUPPORTS

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	GUIDING/KEY QUESTIONS	SCORE
Materials designed for each student’s regular and active participation in grade-level/grade-band/series content. 14 possible points	3i. Materials provide strategies and supports for students in special populations to support their regular and active participation in learning grade-level/series theatre. (2 points)	Do materials provide differentiation support to engage all students in the arts content? Do the materials include overarching guidance on strategies and accommodations for special populations?	0 1 2
	3j. Materials provide extensions and/or opportunities for students to engage with grade-level/course-level theatre at higher levels of complexity. (2 points)	Do the materials engage students to guide their artistic, creative, and technical development?	0 1 2
	3k. Materials provide varied approaches to learning tasks over time and variety in how students are expected to demonstrate their learning with opportunities for students to monitor their learning. (2 points)	Do materials suggest strategies and support for students’ exploration of grade- or skill-level content at a higher level of complexity, not students completing additional tasks, but as an extension of their learning?	0 1 2
	3l. Materials provide opportunities for teachers to use a variety of grouping strategies. (2 points)	Do the materials include overarching guidance on strategies and accommodations for special populations?	0 1 2

	3m. Materials provide guidance to encourage teachers to draw upon student cultural and social backgrounds to facilitate learning. (2 points)	Do the materials identify research-based strategies?	0 1 2
	3n. Materials provide a balance of images or information about people, representing various demographic and physical characteristics. (2 points)	Does the instructional material provide a balanced representation of people from different demographic backgrounds and physical characteristics to promote inclusivity?	0 1 2
	3o. Materials provide guidance to encourage teachers to draw upon student home language to facilitate learning. (2 points)		0 1 2

TOTAL SCORE CRITERION 3.3
Meets: 11-14 points | **Partially Meets:** 8-10 points | **Does Not Meet:** 0-7 points

Criterion 3.4: INTENTIONAL DESIGN

CRITERIA	INDICATORS OF SUPERIOR QUALITY	GUIDING/KEY QUESTIONS	SCORE
Materials are visually engaging and references or integrates digital technology (when applicable), with guidance for teachers. 14 possible points	3p. Materials integrate technology such as interactive tools, ancillaries, virtual manipulatives/objects, and/ or dynamic digital software in ways that engage students in the grade-level/series standards, when applicable. (4 points)	Do the materials integrate digital technology and interactive tools in ways that support student engagement in the arts subjects?	0 2 4
	3q. Materials include or reference digital technology that provides opportunities for students to collaborate, when applicable. (2 points)	Do digital materials provide opportunities for students to collaborate?	0 1 2
	3r. The visual design (whether in print or digital) supports students in engaging thoughtfully with the subject and is neither distracting nor chaotic. (4 points)	Does visual design support student learning and engagement?	0 2 4
	3s. Materials provide teacher guidance for the use of embedded technology to support	Do the materials provide teacher guidance for the use of embedded	0 2 4

	and enhance student learning, when applicable. (4 points)	technology to support and enhance student learning?	
TOTAL SCORE CRITERION 3.4			
Meets: 11-14 points Partially Meets: 8-10 points Does Not Meet: 0-7 points			

Gateway 3 Points AVAILABLE	Gateway 3 Points ACHIEVED	GATEWAY 3 RATING
48	Sum of Criterion 3.1, 3.2, 3.3, and 3.4 points	<input type="checkbox"/> Meets (score of 37-48 points) <input type="checkbox"/> Partially Meets (score of 25-36 points) <input type="checkbox"/> Does Not Meet (score of 0-24 points)

TOTAL SCORE (Gateway 1, 2, and 3)			
GATEWAY 1	GATEWAY 2	GATEWAY 3	GRAND TOTAL
of 20 points	of 22 points	of 48 points	of 90 points